

IN RE: PELVIC MESH/GYNECARE  
LITIGATION

SUPERIOR COURT OF NEW JERSEY

LAW DIVISION: BERGEN COUNTY

CASE NO. 291

MASTER DOCKET NO.: BER-L-11575-14

CIVIL ACTION

CASE

MANAGEMENT ORDER #74

All prior orders remain in full force and effect except as modified by this Order.

THIS MATTER having been reassigned to the Bergen County Vicinage, from Atlantic County, pursuant to the Supreme Court's Order of October 31, 2014; the Court having conducted a Case Management Conference; counsel appearing; for good cause shown and for the reasons set forth on the record;

IT IS on this 18<sup>th</sup> day of August, 2021, ORDERED as follows:

I. CASE MANAGEMENT

A. Status of the TVT-O cases the Court previously selected for an October 26, 2020 trial date:

1. Farnsworth, Cheri Lynn & Leland, (BER-L-014433-14), Hecht Kleeger and Oshman & Mirisola. This case has been reinstated to the trial pool calendar to be tried as a single plaintiff case. The parties shall meet and confer to submit to the Court a Ninth Amended Pretrial Order that contemplates a trial to begin no earlier than the first week of March, 2022.

B. Status of remaining single product TVT retropublic cases for discovery pool, previously slated for a January 11, 2021 trial date:

1. There remains 1 Case in the pool as of this date:

Nemcek, Madeline & Richard	Oshman & Mirisola	BER-L-012359-14
----------------------------	-------------------	-----------------

2. The Nemcek case currently is not in compliance with this Court's April 16, 2020 TVT Retropublic 2020 Discovery Pool Pre-Trial Order ( Fifth Amended). Plaintiff has agreed to make herself

available for a medical examination in New Jersey by Defendants' expert by no later than August 31, 2021. The Parties will meet and Confer to propose to the Court a Sixth Amended Pre-Trial Order for the completion of discovery of this Case. Plaintiff requests that this case be added/included in the next pool of TVT retropublic cases. It is Defendants' position that this case should remain in the 2020 TVT Retropublic 2020 Discovery Pool and that the completion of discovery and scheduling of a trial date following the trial of the Farnsworth Case not be delayed by incorporation into a newly formed discovery pool.

- C. Status of **mixed-manufacturer cases**. An updated spreadsheet of active cases from CMO 70, Exhibit A has been submitted to the Court. All active cases remaining on that list (attached hereto as Exhibit A) shall be and are hereby activated for discovery.
- (i) Any counsel who does not believe that their case belongs in active discovery shall notify liaison counsel [[ASlater@mazieslater.com](mailto:ASlater@mazieslater.com); [Kerawford@riker.com](mailto:Kerawford@riker.com)] within 10 days of the date of this Order. A native format version of Exhibit A also can be obtained from liaison counsel.
  - (ii) To the extent not already done as per CMO 67, updated PFS and authorizations shall be served by no later than September 14, 2021. The parties are reminded that there is an ongoing obligation to update PFS and produce medical records if there is a change in the plaintiff's medical condition, including, but not limited to, additional treatment or revision surgeries.
  - (iii) The parties are immediately to begin scheduling fact discovery, depositions of plaintiff(s), any requested sales representative(s), and deposition of implanting and any other necessary treating physicians subject to sufficient records collection. The Court will establish formal interim deadlines for these preliminary discovery milestones in the near future, but the parties are not to delay awaiting the entry of these deadlines.
- D. Status of updated list of **active Ethicon cases not subject to MSA** for purposes of selecting future discovery pools. An updated spreadsheet of active cases from CMO 70, Exhibit B has been submitted to the Court.
- (i) The following cases in the eight pools identified below shall be and are hereby activated for discovery.

- (ii) Any counsel who does not believe that their case belongs in any of the pools below, shall notify liaison counsel within 20 days of the date of this Order.
- (iii) The Court and the parties will evaluate the status of the selected cases and the potential need to modify the lists and establish staggered interim deadlines once the discovery pools are set.

1. **Prolift +M**

1	Cagle, Starlett Renee v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-012510-14	Hecht Kleeger	Prolift +M Total TVT Obturator
2	Cottrell, Teresa v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-013777-14	Hecht Kleeger; Oshman & Mirisola	Prolift +M Posterior
3	Shim, Chang Helen v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-004432-18	Hecht Kleeger; Oshman & Mirisola	Prolift +M Posterior Prolene Soft Mesh TVT Obturator
4	Black, Bonnie v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006236-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolift+M TVT
5	Hart, Sheila v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006178-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolift+M TVT Obturator
6	Leonard, Barb v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006186-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolift+M TVT
7	Smithlin, Susan v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006545-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolift+M Total TVT Obturator

8	Chusid, Sonia v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-004743-20	Law Offices of Sadaka Associates	Prolift +M Anterior
9	Johnson, Carol v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-000402-20	Mazie Slater	Prolift +M Anterior TVT Exact
10	Keene, Patricia v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-012356-14	Mazie Slater Katz & Freeman	Prolift+M TVT-O
11	Laframboise, Angela v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-007850-16	Mazie Slater Katz & Freeman	Prolift+M TVT
12	Olah, Marie v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-012807-14	Mazie Slater Katz & Freeman	Prolift+M TVT Secur
13	Charfauros, Rachel v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-007302-18	Napoli Shkolnik	Prolift+M TVT Obturator
14	Eddington, Laneshia v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-013459-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolift +M Anterior Obtryx (BS) <sup>1</sup>
15	Heidemarie, Plum v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006432-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolift+M
16	Nixon, Betty v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006427-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolift+M TVT Secur
17	Rozear, Kerri v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-002956-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolift +M TVT Obturator
18	Sorenson, Benita v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006470-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolift+M

<sup>1</sup> There has been a representation that the claims against Boston Scientific have been dismissed, but the dismissal does not appear on the docket.

2. **Prosima**

1	Godoy, Maricel v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-011882-14	Mazie Slater Katz & Freeman	Prosima TVT-O TVT
2	McCormick, Sandra v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-003944-18	Mazie Slater Katz & Freeman	Prosima
3	Druker, Deborah v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-008165-16	Seeger Weiss	Prosima Anterior (Monarc) <sup>2</sup>

3. **TVT-Exact**

1	Gauldin, Wigington Liza Sue v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-008817-19	Aaron M. Levine & Associates; Stark & Stark	TVT Exact
2	Mays, Magdalena v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-000352-20	Aaron M. Levine & Associates; Stark & Stark	TVT Exact
3	Snyder, Susan v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-001409-20	Aaron M. Levine & Associates; Stark & Stark	TVT Exact
4	Blazer, Virginia v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-001272-17	Cohen, Placitella & Roth; Motley Rice	TVT Exact Monarc (AMS)

<sup>2</sup> Representation that claims against Monarc product are not active.

5	Jordan, Audrey v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-004159-20	Law Offices of Sadaka Associates	TVT Exact
6	Mcgahuey, Raeann v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-004161-20	Law Offices of Sadaka Associates	TVT Exact
7	Altenhofen, Deborah v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-008507-19	Mazie Slater	TVT Exact
8	Platt, Delores v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-012083-14	Napoli Shkolnik	TVT Exact
9	Miller, Jeffrey (Estate of Linda) v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-002597-20	Schroeder Law Office	TVT Exact

4. **TVT-Abbrevo**

1	Pinto, Linda v. Ethicon, Inc.	BER-L-008065-20	Flint Law Firm	TVT Abbrevo
2	Percia, Irena D v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-009279-15	Miller & Gaudio, P.C.	TVT Abbrevo
3	Suarez, Rosa v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-004036-19	Pogust Braslow & Millrood	TVT Abbrevo
4	Welker, Joleen v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-8055-16	Wagstaff Cartmell	TVT Abbrevo

5. **TVT Retropubic.** The following are the 25 randomly selected cases:

	Case Name	Docket No.	Plaintiffs' Law Firm	Product(s)
1	Ketchum, Dawn v. Ethicon (22) <sup>3</sup>	BER-L-010326-14	Hecht Kleeger	TVT
2	Wyett, Barbara v. Ethicon (59)	BER-L-011876-14	Oshman & Mirisola	TVT
3	Martin, Kathleen v. Ethicon (26)	BER-L-013096-14	Hecht Kleeger /Oshman Mirisola	TVT
4	Broderson, Julie v. Ethicon (38)	BER-L-013886-14	Oshman & Mirisola	TVT <sup>4</sup>
5	Norris, Julie v. Ethicon (32)	BER-L-002974-20	Law Offices of Sadaka Associates	TVT
6	Link, Tammi v. Bard, et als (4)	BER-L-014231-14	Bernstein Liebhard	Avaulta (Bard) <sup>5</sup> and TVT
7	Steadman, Teresa v. Ethicon (56)	BER-L-011516-14	Oshman & Mirisola	TVT <sup>6</sup>
8	Pryor, Shirley v. Ethicon (53)	BER-L-014341-14	Oshman & Mirisola	TVT
9	Cates, Shirley v. Ethicon (68)	BER-L-007281-19	Schroeder Law Office	TVT
10	Blanca, Colajai v. Ethicon (66)	BER-L-000023-21	Schroeder Law Office	TVT
11	Hinderer, Donna v. Ethicon (36)	BER-L-017429-14	Morelli Alters Ratner	MiniArc (AMS) <sup>7</sup> /TVT
12	Jacobs, Lauralee v. Ethicon (45)	BER-L-013739-14	Oshman & Mirisola	TVT
13	Castro, Angelina v. Ethicon (65)	BER-L-001642-20	Schroeder Law Office	TVT
14	Cox, Mary v. Ethicon (28)	BER-L-010515-14	Law Offices of Lawrence S. Paikoff; Seeger Weiss	TVT
15	Lalla, Rebecca v. Ethicon (3)	BER-L-003935-20	Baron & Budd	TVT

<sup>3</sup> Parenthetical number refers to the original number of the case as it appeared on Exhibit B, submitted to the Court on August 5, 2021.

<sup>4</sup> Also involves a Bard implant, but Bard is not a defendant.

<sup>5</sup> Bard dismissed with prejudice by Order dated August 16, 2017.

<sup>6</sup> Was part of 2020 TVT-Retropubic pool, but was removed due to awaiting appointment of Special Counsel for Bankruptcy Trustee.

<sup>7</sup> Need to assess status of AMS. According to what is available on eCourts, the Complaint names AMS and there is no dismissal of AMS on eCourts. If AMS is still a party, this case should be an Exhibit A case and not an Exhibit B Case.

16	Teran, Thelma v. Ethicon (57)	BER-L-012019-14	Oshman & Mirisola	TVT
17	Zobel, Terri v. Ethicon (20)	BER-L-000293-21	Flint Law Firm	TVT
18	Hailey, Mechele Lea v. Ethicon (25)	BER-L-010734-14	Hecht Kleeger / Oshman & Mirisola	TVT
19	Flores, Sahara v. Ethicon (62)	BER-L-004037-19	Pogust Braslow & Millrood	TVT
20	Ricciuti, Dolores v. Ethicon (19)	BER-L-008069-20	Flint Law Firm	TVT
21	McCutchen, Denise v. Ethicon (12)	BER-L-011757-14	Cohen, Placitella/ Motley Rice	Monarc (AMS) <sup>8</sup> / TVT
22	Levin, Hilda v. Ethicon (47)	BER-L-013976-14	Oshman & Mirisola	TVT
23	Zechello, Patricia v. Ethicon (61)	BER-L-013481-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Mersilene /TVT
24	Powell, Nancy v. Ethicon (13)	BER-L-014995-14	Cohen Placitella/ Motley Rice	TVT
25	Montgomery, Nellie v. Ethicon (69)	BER-L-004276-20	Schroeder Law Office	TVT

6. **TVT-O**. The following are the 25 randomly selected cases:

	Case Name	Docket No.	Plaintiffs' Law Firm	Product(s)
1	Bonilla, Maria v. Ethicon (61)	BER-L-002596-20	Schroeder Law Office	TVT-O
2	Boen, Brandy v. Ethicon (22)	BER-L-012934-14	Hovde Dassow / The Lanier Firm	TVT-O
3	Gonzalez, Sandra. Ethicon (39)	BER-L-019551-14	Mazie Slater	TVT-O
4	Shaw-Pope, Donna v. Ethicon (15)	BER-L-008070-20	Flint Law Firm	TVT-O
5	Pina, Annie v. Ethicon (64)	BER-L-002952-20	Schroeder Law Office	TVT-O
6	Whitaker, Anne v. Ethicon (13)	BER-L-013044-14	Cohen Placitella / Motley Rice	Monarc (AMS) <sup>9</sup> / TVT-O

<sup>8</sup> Bard, Boston Scientific and AMS were all dismissed with prejudice by Stipulation dated November 12, 2019.



7	Crandall, Doreen v. Ethicon (51)	BER-L-01385-14	Oshman & Mirisola	TVT-O
8	Regaldo, Veronica v. Ethicon (30)	BER-L-004741-20	Law Offices of Sadaka Associates	TVT-O
9	Shaver, Carlene v. Ethicon (67)	BER-L-002959-20	Schroeder Law Office	TVT-O
10	Brown, Erica v. Ethicon (17)	BER-L-010325-14	Hecht Kleeger	TVT-O
11	Konrad, Sandra v. Ethicon (54)	BER-L-020326-14	Oshman & Mirisola	TVT-O
12	Kiser, Heather v. Ethicon (32)	BER-L-007785-19	Marc J. Bern	TVT-O
13	Barnes, Patricia v. Ethicon (60)	BER-L-002600-20	Schroeder Law Office	TVT-O
14	Taylor, Maria v. Ethicon (68)	BER-L-004895-20	Schroeder Law Office	TVT-O
15	Izzi, Deborah v. Ethicon (53)	BER-L-012360-14	Oshman & Mirisola	TVT-O
16	Ledford, Vickie v. Ethicon (33)	BER-L-000500-20	Mazie Slater	TVT-O
17	Hildebrande, Kimberly v. Ethicon (40)	BER-L-012896-14	Mazie Slater	TVT-O
18	Grisanti, Ermese v. Ethicon (28)	BER-L-02973-20	Law Offices of Sadaka Associates	TVT-O
19	West, Debra v. Ethicon (36)	BER-L-000570-20	Mazie Slater	TVT-O
20	Nelson, Rachel v. Ethicon (2)	BER-L-0105073-14	Andrus Wagstaff / Sanders Viener	TVT-O
21	Ingram Gerhart, Susan v. Ethicon (48)	BER-L-014464-14	Napoli Shkolnik	TVT-O
22	Permelia, Barbara v. Ethicon (21)	BER-L-011074-14	Hecht Kleeger / Oshman & Mirisola	TVT-O
23	Cassidy, Colleen v. Ethicon (24)	BER-L-006690-20	Johnson Law Group	TVT-O
24	Chasteen, Chrissie v. Ethicon (26)	BER-L-001007-20	Law Offices of Sadaka Associates	TVT-O
25	Layton, Janet v. Ethicon (63)	BER-L-000778-19	Schroeder Law Office	TVT-O

<sup>9</sup> There is no indication on eCourts that AMS has been dismissed. If AMS is active, then this case belongs on Exhibit A, not Exhibit B.

7. **TVT-S.** The following are the 25 randomly selected cases:

	Case Name	Docket No.	Plaintiffs' Law Firm	Product(s)
1	Petkas, Gayle v. Ethicon (2)	BER-L-003561-15	Aylstock Witkin	TVT-S
2	Walpole, Diane v. Ethicon (14)	BER-L-006919-20	Johnson Law Group	TVT-S
3	Ovivion, Donna v. Ethicon (17)	BER-L-007648-20	Mazie Slater	TVT-S
4	Williams, Natalie v. Ethicon (37)	BER-L-006493-20	Schroeder Law Office	TVT-S
5	Hackett, Catherine v. Ethicon (13)	BER-L-006176-20	Johnson Law Group	TVT-S
6	Tremblay, Nancy v. Ethicon (35)	BER-L-006488-20	Schroeder Law Office	TVT-S
7	McNeal, Brunella v. Ethicon (30)	BER-L-006420-20	Schroder Law Office	TVT-S
8	Evans, Deonna v. Ethicon (11)	BER-L-006164-20	Johnson Law Group	TVT-S
9	Stehlik, Tanya v. Ethicon (34)	BER-L-006472-20	Schroeder Law Office	TVT-S
10	De Le Vingne, Marie v. Ethicon (10)	BER-L-006252-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolene / TVT-S
11	Robbins, Patricia Anne v. Ethicon (5)	BER-L-010217-14	Hecht Kleeger	TVT Exact / TVT S
12	McMillin, Gwendolyn v. Ethicon (23)	BER-L-012342-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Monarc (AMS) <sup>10</sup> / TVT-O / TVT-S
13	Taylor, Cheryl v. Ethicon (39)	BER-L-010630-14	The Miller Firm	TVT-S
14	Madden, Tilda v. Ethicon (22)	BER-L-013486-14	Oshman & Mirisola	TVT-S
15	Lord, Sherry v. Ethicon (21)	BER-L-010310-14	Oshman & Mirisola	TVT-S
16	Wilcox, Taja v. Ethicon (38)	BER-L-001510-20	Stark & Stark	TVT-S

<sup>10</sup> AMS not a defendant.

17	Burroughs, Laura v. Ethicon (3)	BER-L-15645-14	Bernstein Liebhard/ Jan Meyer	Monarc (AMS) <sup>11</sup> / TVT-S
18	Bartlett, Anne v. Ethicon (8)	BER-L-006228-20	Johnson Law Group	TVT-S
19	Anderson, Lisa v. Ethicon (20)	BER-L-13733-14	Oshman & Mirisola	TVT S
20	Lewellyn, Lory v. Ethicon (29)	BER-L-006412-20	Schroder Law Office	Lynx (BS) <sup>12</sup> TVT-Secur
21	Lopez, Ernestina v. Ethicon (15)	BER-L-000353-20	Law Offices of Sadaka Associates	TVT-S
22	Hegdahl, Carol v. Ethicon (26)	BER-L-006366-20	Schroeder Law Office	TVT-S
23	Cole, Carol v. Ethicon (9)	BER-L-006245-20	Johnson Law Group	TVT-S
24	Welton, Samantha v. Ethicon (36)	BER-L-006491-20	Schroeder	TVT-O/ TVT- S
25	Scott, Maria v. Ethicon (24)	BER-L-012344-14	Oshman & Mirisola	TVT-S

8. **Prolift.** The following are the 25 randomly selected cases:

	Case Name	Docket No.	Plaintiffs' Law Firm	Product(s)
1	Gillette, Kristen v. Ethicon (45)	BER-L-005550-20	Mazie Slater	Prolift Anterior / Prolift Posterior / TVT-O
2	Herring, Vonda v. Ethicon (58)	BER-L-011115-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolift Total / TVT-S
3	Fogel, Debbie v. Ethicon (22)	BER-L-006167-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolift
4	Dollens, Betty v. Ethicon (18)	BER-L-006254-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolift/ TVT- O
5	Rasoulilian, Shahla v. Ethicon (38)	BER-L-007881-19	Mazie Slater	Prolift Total / Artisyn / TVT Exact
6	Hatton, Joyce v. Ethicon (57)	BER-L-012358-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolift Total / TVT-O

<sup>11</sup> AMS is not a defendant.

<sup>12</sup> Boston Scientific is not a defendant.

7	Paperd, Tanya v. Ethicon (33)	BER-L-005331-20	Law Offices of Sadaka Associates	Prolift
8	Ayala, Elizabeth v. Ethicon (14)	BER-L-006218-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolift / TVT- O
9	Weaver, Lanetta v. Ethicon (67)	BER-L-012343-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolift Anterior
10	Barta, Doreen v. Ethicon (16)	BER-L-006225-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolift / TVT- S
11	Raygoza, Griselda v. Ethicon (90)	BER-L-002953-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolift Posterior / Gynemesh PS / TVT-S
12	Burgos, Cynthia v. Ethicon (8)	BER-L-004748-16	Hecht Kleeger	Prolift Posterior
13	Washington, Marjorie v. Ethicon (66)	BER-L-014610-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolift total
14	Johnson, Georgann v. Ethicon (25)	BER-L-006543-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolift Total
15	Figueroa, Maria v. Ethicon (55)	BER-L-013972-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolift Posterior
16	Price, Gina v. Ethicon (62)	BER-L-013411-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolift Total
17	Jarzyna, Felicia v. Ethicon (35)	BER-L-003258-20	Lieff Cabraser	Prolift Posterior
18	Messina, Anne Marie v. Ethicon (73)	BER-L-000360-18	Rheingold	Prolift Anterior / TVT
19	Pokler, Marina v. Ethicon (48)	BER-L-015644-14	Mazie Slater	Prolift / TVT- S
20	DeMaria, Andrea v. Ethicon (54)	BER-L-012362-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolift Total / TVT
21	Susholz, Judith v. Ethicon (65)	BER-L-004537-16	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolift / TV-O / Intepro (AMS) <sup>13</sup>
22	Lowe, Ricie v. Ethicon (27)	BER-L-006188-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolift / TVT- O
23	Alford, Jean v. Ethicon (75)	BER-L-006083-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolift/ TVT- O
24	Diaz, Diana v. Ethicon (77)	BER-L-006632-20	Schroder Law Office	Prolift Total / TVT-S
25	Crist, Mary Susan v. Ethicon	BER-L-000497-20	Mazie Slater	Prolift

<sup>13</sup> AMS not a defendant.

	(39)			Anterior / TVT-O
--	------	--	--	---------------------

- E. To the extent not already done by June 1, 2021 as required by CMO 70, plaintiffs shall serve by September 14, 2021, in all of the cases identified in Paragraph III(D)(1) through (8), above, (in accordance with the Ethicon PFS Service protocols):
- a. a certified, updated Plaintiff Fact Sheet (“PFS”);
  - b. updated executed medical records authorizations;
  - c. product implant stickers for all products at issue or implanted in Plaintiff;
  - d. implant operative report; and
  - e. operative report(s) for any revision procedure; or
  - f. if applicable in lieu of 6(a)-(e), above, a certification that no changes or updates are required to the PFS, authorizations and/or other documents.<sup>14</sup>
- F. For each pool of cases identified in Paragraph III(D)(1) through (8), above, even though interim deadlines have not yet been formally established, the Court expects the parties to begin scheduling fact discovery, including depositions of plaintiff(s) and deposition of implanting and any other necessary treating physicians subject to sufficient records collection.
- G. **Gynemesh/Prolene/Prolene Soft/Ultrapro/Mersilene** cases. By no later than September 14, 2021, 2021, counsel for plaintiffs in any case in which the product at issue includes Gynemesh, Prolene or Prolene soft, Ultrapro or Mersilene<sup>15</sup> shall meet and confer with counsel for the defense (Kelly Crawford [kcrawford@riker.com](mailto:kcrawford@riker.com)) and provide proof regarding product identification and whether the product was implanted transvaginally or

<sup>14</sup> The parties are reminded that there is an ongoing obligation to update PFS and produce medical records if there is a change in the plaintiff’s medical condition, including, but not limited to, additional treatment or revision surgeries.

<sup>15</sup> As per Exhibit B to CMO 70 as updated, the cases that fall into this category include, but may not be limited to, those identified on the chart attached hereto as Exhibit C.

abdominally. The parties shall report back to the Court at the following case management conference regarding the results of the meet and confer and with recommendations as to how to proceed with these cases.

**II. MISCELLANEOUS**

The next case management conference will be held on September 20, 2021 at 10:30 am for liaison counsel only and at 11:00 am for all counsel on the record. The Conference will be virtual or telephonic.

  
RACHELLE L. HARZ, J.S.C.

- Exhibit A -  
Mixed Manufacturer Cases

	Case Name	Case Number	Plaintiffs Counsel
2	Aguirre, Susan v. Mentor Corporation, Mentor Worldwide, LLC, Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson, and John Does 1-20	BER-L-008298-19	Adam M. Slater, Esq. Mazie Slater Katz & Freeman, LLC 103 Eisenhower Parkway Roseland, NJ 07068
3	Clark, Sandra	BER-L-002463-17	Leiff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein
4	Eberhart, Lori v. Coloplast Corp., et al.	BER-L-014155-14	Motley Rice; Cohen Placitella
5	Harvey, Mary v. Mentor Worldwide LLC, et al.	BER-L-019852-14	Bernstein Liebhard; Jan Meyer
6	Koontz, Sara Anne v. Mpathy Medical Devices, et al.	BER-L-014159-14	Motley Rice
7	Mann, Carol & Thomas v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc. and Mentor Worldwide, LLC	BER-L-005252-15	Jeffrey S. Grand, Esq. Bernstein Liebhard, LLP 10 East 40th Street New York, NY 10016 Solomon Rubin, Esq. Law Offices of Jan Meyer & Assoc., P.C. 1092 Teaneck Rd., 2nd Floor Teaneck, NJ 07666
8	Monaco, Rosemary v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc. and Mentor Worldwide, LLC	BER-L-005893-15	Jeffrey S. Grand, Esq. Bernstein Liebhard, LLP 10 East 40th Street New York, NY 10016 Solomon Rubin, Esq. Law Offices of Jan Meyer & Assoc., P.C. 1092 Teaneck Rd., 2nd Floor Teaneck, NJ 07666
9	Posey, Shirley v. Ethicon, Inc., et al.	BER-L-017433-14	Cohen Placitella; Motley Rice
10	Tolson, Melliny and Phillip v. Mentor Corporation, Mentor Worldwide LLC, Ethicon, Inc. Ethicon Women's Health and Urology, a division of Ethicon, Inc., Gynecare, and Johnson & Johnson	BER-L-003777-16	Adam M. Slater, Esq. Mazie Slater Katz & Freeman, LLC 103 Eisenhower Pkwy Roseland, NJ 07068
11	Andrus, Mary and Kay A. v. Johnson & Johnson, et al.	BER-L-016636-14	Bernstein Liebhard; Jan Meyer
12	Barrett, Theresa & Gary	BER-L-015310-14	Lopez McHugh
13	Bell, Ann Louise	BER-L-011704-14	Cohen, Placitella & Roth, PC & Motley Rice
14	Bjelica, Slavica v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc. and Mentor Worldwide, LLC	BER-L-001505-15	Jeffrey S. Grand, Esq. Bernstein Liebhard, LLP 10 East 40th Street New York, NY 10016 Solomon Rubin, Esq. Law Offices of Jan Meyer & Assoc., P.C. 1092 Teaneck Rd., 2nd Floor Teaneck, NJ 07666
15	Brown, Cyndi	BER-L-008718-17	Kline & Specter

- Exhibit A -  
Mixed Manufacturer Cases

16	Cordero, Evangelina Basurto	BER-L-007539-19	Schroeder Law Office
17	Davis, Judith	BER-L-010430-15	Mazie Slater Katz & Freeman
18	Dicken, Jacqueline	BER-L-004647-18	Kline & Specter
19	Flatt, Anna P.	BER-L-013628-14	Leiff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein
20	Hendrickson, Susan v. Ethicon, Inc., et al.	BER-L-000940-16	Seeger Weiss
21	Herges, Carol v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc. and Mentor Worldwide, LLC	BER-L-006823-15	Jeffrey S. Grand, Esq. Bernstein Liebhard, LLP 10 East 40th Street New York, NY 10016 Solomon Rubin, Esq. Law Offices of Jan Meyer & Assoc., P.C. 1092 Teaneck Rd., 2nd Floor Teaneck, NJ 07666
22	Herring, Carolyn v. Johnson & Johnson, et al.	BER-L-003941-15	Bernstein Liebhard; Jan Meyer
23	Hill, Mae Marie	BER-L-011082-14	James D. Barger, Esq. Aylstock, Witkin, Krels & Overholtz, PLLC 17 East Main Street Suite 200 Pensacola, FL 32502
24	James, Clarice v. Mentor Worldwide LLC, Ethicon, Inc. Ethicon Women's Health and Urology, a division of Ethicon, Inc., Gynecare, and Johnson & Johnson	BER-L-006764-17	Daniel Burke, Esq. Bernstein Liebhard, LLP 10 East 40th Street New York, NY 10016 Robert Gammel, Esq. Law Offices of Jan Meyer & Assoc., P.C. 1092 Teaneck Rd., 2nd Floor Teaneck, NJ 07666
25	King, Nancy v. Ethicon, Inc., et al.	BER-L-015125-14	Cohen Placitella; Motley Rice
26	Koberstein, Darlene & James	BER-L-010662-14	Cohen, Placitella & Roth, P.C. 2001 Market Street, Suite 2900 Philadelphia, PA 19103 Tele: 215-567-3500 and Motley Rice LLC 321 South Main Street Providence, RI 02903 Tele: 401-457-7700 Fax: 401-457-7708
27	Lema, Rhonda	BER-L-006548-19	Kline & Specter
28	Marazzo, Nancy v. Ethicon, Inc., et al.	BER-L-016237-14	Sanders Viener
29	Neuhaus, Karen and Perry Neuhaus v. Mentor Corporation, Mentor Worldwide LLC, Ethicon, Inc. and Johnson & Johnson	BER-L-015544-14	Adam M. Slater, Esq. Mazie Slater Katz & Freeman, LLC 103 Eisenhower Pkwy Roseland, NJ 07068
30	Newsome, Sharon & Carl	BER-L-015320-14	Lopez McHugh
31	Panczykowski, Fae	BER-L-014959-14	Oshman & Mirisola



- Exhibit A -  
Mixed Manufacturer Cases

32	Parker, Armella and Steven Parker v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc., and Mentor Worldwide, LLC	BER-L-017269-14	Jeffrey S. Grand, Esq. Bernstein Liebhard, LLP 10 East 40th Street New York, NY 10016 Solomon Rubin, Esq. Law Offices of Jan Meyer & Assoc., P.C. 1092 Teaneck Rd., 2nd Floor Teaneck, NJ 07666
33	Polo, Lenra	BER-L-016317-14	Kline & Specter
34	Romano, Judy	BER-L-014034-14	Cohen, Placitella & Roth, PC & Flint Law Firm
35	Schmidt, Robin	BER-L-012564-14	Derek T. Braslo, Esq. Pogust Braslow & Millrood, LLC Eight Tower Bridge, Suite 1520 161 Washington Street Conshohocken, PA 19428
36	Sheppard-Rand, Wanda Elizabeth	BER-L-013562-14	Cohen, Placitella & Roth, PC & Motley Rice
37	Smith, Dorothy v. Coloplast Corp., et al.	BER-L-015044-14	D'Onofrio Firm; Fleming Nolen
38	Sorantino, Vanessa	BER-L-005011-17	Kline & Specter
39	Trout, Sharon v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc., and Mentor Worldwide, LLC	BER-L-017255-14	Jeffrey S. Grand, Esq. Bernstein Liebhard, LLP 10 East 40th Street New York, NY 10016 Solomon Rubin, Esq. Law Offices of Jan Meyer & Assoc., P.C. 1092 Teaneck Rd., 2nd Floor Teaneck, NJ 07666
40	Troyer, Deborah R.	BER-L-005133-19	James A. Maggs, Esq. Maggs & McDermott, LLC Allaire Corporate Center 3349 Highway 138, Building C, Suite D Wall, NJ 00719
41	Walton, Stephanie v. Ethicon, Inc., et al.	BER-L-015303-14	Lopez McHugh
42	Ware, Shirley	BER-L-006800-16	Mazie Slater Katz & Freeman
43	Wheeler, Pamela v. Ethicon Inc., Ethicon's Women's Health and Urology, a Division of Ethicon, Inc., Gynecare, Johnson & Johnson, Mentor Worldwide, LLC; Coloplast Corp., CR Bard, Inc., Sofradium Production SAS, Tissue Science Laboratories Limited, American Medical Systems, Boston Scientific Corporation	BER-L-011103-14	Theodore Oshman Oshman & Mirisola, LLP 42 Broadway New York, NY 10004 M. Brandon Smith Childer Schlueter & Smith, LLC 1932 N. Druid Hills Road, Suite 100 Atlanta, GA 30319
44	Wood, Julie	BER-L-015591-14	Kline & Specter
45	Worsham, Maebeth	BER-L-007209-19	Kline & Specter
46	Jones, Terrie	BER-L-012696-14	Bernstein Liebhard

- Exhibit A -  
Mixed Manufacturer Cases

47	BIGBEE-BRAGG QUEENA VS JOHNSON & JOHNSON	BER-L-010079-15	Bernstein Liebhard
48	HELOU MICHELLE WIDAD VS ETHICON INC	BER-L-014950-14	Oshman & Mirisola
49	PENN DONNA VS ETHICON INC	BER-L-015640-14	Oshman & Mirisola
50	ADAMS PATRICIA V ETHICON INC ET AL	BER-L-015394-14	Blau Leonard Law Group
51	ENGLISH KATHY V ETHICON INC ET AL	BER-L-015397-14	Blau Leonard Law Group
52	MOHRING JOANMARIE V ETHICON INC	BER-L-015722-14	Simonson Hess Leibowitz & Goodman
53	LAWSON TINA ET ALS VS ETHICON INC ET ALS	BER-L-011836-14	The Miller Firm
54	WATKINS CHRYSALVS ETHICON INC	BER-L-010310-15	Bernstein Liebhard; Law Offices of Jan Meyer & Associates

# EXHIBIT B INTENTIONALLY OMITTED

Any counsel who wishes to receive a native version copy of the updated spreadsheet of CMO 70 Exhibit B active Ethicon cases that was submitted to the Court on August 5, 2021, from which the Court made random case selections may request same from Liaison Counsel:

[aslater@mazieslater.com](mailto:aslater@mazieslater.com)

[kcrawford@riker.com](mailto:kcrawford@riker.com)

## EXHIBIT C to CMO 74

Pelvic Mesh/ Gynecare – MCL No. 291

Bergen County Master Docket Number BER-L-11571-14

### Gynemesh PS/Prolene/Prolene Soft/Ultrapo/Mersilene Cases

1	Ruiz, Cynthia v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006460-20	Schroeder Law Office	Gynemesh PS Prolene
2	Sierra, Sharlene v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-002960-20	Schroeder Law Office	Gynemesh PS
3	Stotts, Esther v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-002961-20	Schroeder Law Office	Gynemesh PS TVT Abbrevo
4	Toro, Maria v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006486-20	Schroeder Law Office	Gynemesh PS
5	Young, Merry v. Ethicon Inc	BER-L-008918-18	The D'Onofrio Firm	Gynemesh PS TVT x2
6	Nevetsky, Cheryl v. Ethicon	BER-L-1062-19	Wagstaff Cartmell	Gynemesh TVT
7	Castro, Rossellbrenda v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-008668-19	Aaron M. Levine & Associates; Stark & Stark	Prolene Mesh x2
8	Blessing, Sheridan v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-001857-15	Bernstein Liebhard; Law Offices of Jan Meyer & Associates	Prolene Mesh Desara (Caldera) <sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> It has been represented that the claims against Caldera for the Desara product have been dismissed. This needs to be confirmed on the docket.

9	Provenzano, Mary v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-007058-15	Bernstein Liebhard; Law Offices of Jan Meyer & Associates	Prolene Soft Mesh
10	Lord, Irene v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-015417-14	Gacovino Lake & Associates; Reyes Browne Reilley	Prolene Mesh
11	Schmidt, Lorraine v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-011131-14	Hecht Kleeger; Oshman & Mirisola	Prolene Soft Mesh Marlex Mesh (Bard) Pelvisoft (Bard) <sup>2</sup>
12	Ayala, Juanita v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006219-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolene Soft
13	Baja, Gerri v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006222-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolene
14	Beard, Ramona v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006234-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolene
15	Bohr Rhonda v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006239-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolene TVT-O
16	Chestang, Karen v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006244-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolene

---

<sup>2</sup> It has been represented that Bard either was not named as a party or the claims against Bard have been settled or otherwise dismissed. This needs to be confirmed on the docket.

17	Cook, Dorothy v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006246-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolene TVT
18	Corona, Charlotte v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006265-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolene
19	Follmer, Audrey v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006168-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolene
20	Fulcher, Viney v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006169-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolene TVT
21	Huston, Barbara v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006180-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolene
22	Johnson, Kathryn v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006182-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolene
23	Makaike, Kelcie v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006189-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolene
24	Matus, Melinda v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006192-20	Johnson Law Group	Prolene
25	Pickney, Mary Jo v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-011454-14	Lieff Cabraser Heimann	Prolene Mesh Avaulta (Bard) PelvicoL(Bard) Pinnacle x2 (BS) <sup>3</sup>

<sup>3</sup> It has been represented that Bard and Boston Scientific either were not named as defendants or the claims as to these defendants and the identified products have been dismissed. This needs to be confirmed on the docket.

26	Demalleville, Nadine v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-010318-14	Lopez McHugh	Prolene Mesh Obtryx (BS) <sup>4</sup>
27	Hayden, Mary v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-012542-14	Nagel Rice; The Potts Law Firm	Prolene Mesh
28	Belt, Jeanette v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-009042-17	Napoli Shkolnik	Prolene Mesh
29	Cormier, Cynthia v. Johnson & Johnson	BER-L-013744-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolene Mesh
30	Cox, Harri v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-013851-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolene Mesh
31	Dangelo, Maria v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-010212-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolene Mesh
32	Gleason, Elizabeth v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-010579-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolene Mesh
33	Greenwood, Roxanne v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-010308-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolene Mesh
34	Mcduffie, Gail v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-012345-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolene Mesh Lynx (BS) <sup>5</sup>

<sup>4</sup> If the claims as to the Obtryx Boston Scientific product are active, this case needs to be moved to the mixed-manufacturer pool. This needs to be confirmed by counsel for plaintiff and counsel for Boston Scientific.

<sup>5</sup> If the claims as to the Lynx Boston Scientific product are active, this case needs to be moved to the mixed-manufacturer pool. This needs to be confirmed by counsel for plaintiff and counsel for Boston Scientific.

35	Mutters, Barbara v. Johnson & Johnson	BER-L-011570-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolene Mesh
36	Valles, Valenzuela Mayra v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-013460-14	Oshman & Mirisola	Prolene Soft Mesh Lynx (BS) <sup>6</sup>
37	Green, Deborah v. Ethicon Inc	BER-L-013294-14	Pro se	Prolene Mesh
38	Alejos, Rosanna v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-002942-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene Soft Mesh TVT TVT Exact
39	Bello, Carmen v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006293-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
40	Black, Christeen v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006298-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
41	Brown, Pat v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006294-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
42	Burson, Sharon v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006302-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene TVT
43	Colby, Robin v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006307-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene

<sup>6</sup> If the claims as to the Lynx Boston Scientific product are active, this case needs to be moved to the mixed-manufacturer pool. This needs to be confirmed by counsel for plaintiff and counsel for Boston Scientific.



44	Coss, Altagracia v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-002944-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene TVT Exact
45	Cragun, Carolyn v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006308-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
46	Cruz, Brenda v Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006309-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
47	Davis, Diane v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006310-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
48	Debardelaben, Darla v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006312-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
49	Donahue, Lori v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-004887-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene Mesh
50	Finer, June v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006434-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene TVT Obturator
51	Goins, Ora v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006357-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene Mesh
52	Gurule, Barbara v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006361-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene TVT
53	Halloran, Judy v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006362-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
54	Hill, Shelby v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006369-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
55	Joshua, Mia v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-002948-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene Soft Mesh

56	Keener, Lynda v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-002949-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
57	Krekeler, Tina v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006377-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
58	Lloyd, Ruth v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006413-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
59	Luna, Danita v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006414-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
60	Mcbee, Debra v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006417-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
61	Mcfadden, Patricia v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006419-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
62	Merritt, Gwen v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006421-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
63	Mirabel, Dulce v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006424-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene Mesh
64	Mitchell, Pamela v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-002972-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene Soft
65	Nelson, Dawn v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-004914-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene Soft Mesh TVT
66	Pickard, Peggy v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006428-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
67	Price, Sonja v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006431-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene

68	Rouse, Debra v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006458-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
69	Simms, Elaine, v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006465-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
70	Soden, Arlene v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006467-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
71	Theresa, Collins v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-3041-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene
72	Torti, Diana v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-006487-20	Schroeder Law Office	Prolene TVT Obturator
73	Pelican, Cathy v. Ethicon, Inc.	BER-L-008062-20	Flint Law Firm	UltraPro
74	Greene, Latonia v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-004275-20	Schroeder Law Office	Mersilene Mesh
75	Kraft, Joyce v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-002598-20	Schroeder Law Office	Ultrapro
76	Wood, Diane v. Ethicon Inc.	BER-L-001244-19	Schroeder Law Office	Mersilene